



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION**

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF. 8.2079-2022-DC-PMC

Dr. Zobia Usman Vs. Dr. Muhammad Sajid Sheikh

Professor Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai	Chairman
Professor Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh	Member
Mr. Jawad Amin Khan	Member
Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor	Secretary
Expert of Surgery	

*Present:*

Dr. Zobia Usman	Complainant
Dr. Muhammad Sajid Sheikh (16593-P)	Respondent
Hearing dated	21.11.2022

**I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

1. Reference was received from the Punjab Healthcare Commission (PHC) in the matter of the complaint filed by Dr. Zobia Usman (the "Complainant") to PHC on 08.07.2019 against Dr. Muhammad Sajid Sheikh (the "Respondent"), for his alleged medical negligence during the Laparoscopic Cholecystectomy procedure of Dr. Muhammad Amir Mushtaq (the "patient").
2. The PHC decided the complaint vide its decision dated 13.12.2021 and forwarded the case to the Pakistan Medical Commission (the "Commission") on 04.01.2022 with the following observations/findings.

*"...As far as the allegations against the doctor/surgeon are concerned, we direct that the case of Respondent doctor Muhammad Sajid Sheikh be referred to PMC for investigation of the allegations as contained in this Complaint. No further order is required to be passed. ..."*

## II. SHOW CAUSE NOTICE TO RESPONDENT, DR. MUHAMMAD SAJID SHEIKH

3. In view of the findings of PHC, Show Cause Notice dated 20.07.2022 was served to Respondent mentioning the allegations in the following terms:

*"...*

3. **WHEREAS**, the Punjab Healthcare Commission (the "PHC") vide decision No. C/2019/149 dated 13.12.2021 decided the complaint filed by Dr. Zobia Usman (hereinafter referred to as the "Complainant") against you and referred the matter to Pakistan Medical Commission.
4. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the reference of PHC, it has been alleged that Dr. Muhammad Aamir Mushtaq (the "Patient"), brother of the Complainant visited your clinic at Saad Hospital, Faisalabad (the "Hospital") on 12.10.2018 and 15.10.2018 and was diagnosed with "Mirizzi Syndrome Type 1" by you. He was initially treated for ascending cholangitis with antibiotics and pain killers.; and
5. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the reference, the patient was admitted at Saad Surgimedical Hospital, Faisalabad on 18.10.2018 where no pre-op investigations except ultrasound were recommended/ done by you. You performed Laparoscopic Cholecystectomy of the patient on the same day and discharged him the next day i.e. 19.10.2018, without any directions for follow up visits which are necessary for post-operation care in cases of Mirizzi Syndrome.; and
6. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the reference, the patient developed jaundice five months after the surgery and he was taken to Shaikh Zayed Hospital, Lahore with complaints of pain abdomen and vomiting where ERCP was performed. As per ERCP Report/notes dated 28.03.2019, the patient was diagnosed of "Tight CBD stricture at the level of Common hepatic duct" and stent in bile duct was deployed and he was discharged. He was again admitted at Shaikh Zayed Hospital on 29.03.2019 with complaints of vomiting and pain abdomen where he was treated and discharged on 02.04.2019. Subsequently, due to deteriorating condition he was moved to Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi on 22.04.2019 where he was diagnosed of Post-pancreatitis Intra-abdominal collection. His exploratory

*laparotomy + Pancreatic Necrosectomy was performed on 27.04.2019 and he remained admitted till 30.05.2019 at Holy Family Hospital. The patient ultimately expired on 21.06.2019; and*

7. **WHEREAS**, *in terms of fact mentioned above, prima facie it appears that you negligently treated the patient pre/ per and post Laparoscopic Cholecystectomy which led to development of severe complications, leading to multiple procedures/ surgeries at different hospitals and ultimately death of the patient. ...”*

### III. REPLY TO SHOW CAUSE NOTICE BY RESPONDENT DR. MUHAMMAD SAJID SHEIKH

4. Respondent, Dr. Muhammad Sajid Sheikh submitted his reply to Show Cause Notice on 12.08.2022, wherein he stated that:

- a) *Patient, Dr. Aamir Mushtaq was presented to me with the complaint of right hypochondrium pain, jaundice, and fever in October 2018. He was accompanied by his family friend, Dr. Asif Razza, Radiologist Saad Medical Complex, Faisalabad.*
- b) *After detailed discussion with patient and his accompanying friend, Dr. Asif Razza, I put him on recommended treatment of antibiotics and anti-inflammatory drugs to which he responded. On follow up visit after a few days, patient's jaundice had improved, his pain was relieved and he was afebrile. On follow up ultrasonography, his common hepatic duct was normal. Although stone was still impacted at the neck of the gall bladder which was distended and he was suffering from continuous pain.*
- c) *I categorically asked the radiologist to rule out common bile duct stone, with further investigations including MRI scan. On follow up, pre-op visit ultrasound showed no evidence of stone in common bile duct so after discussion with the radiologist and the patient MRI was omitted. On the basis of clinical judgment and ultrasonography, patient was diagnosed Type 1 Mirizzi syndrome (a rare complication of gallstone disease) with ascending cholangitis and acute cholecystitis. Although most of the time it's difficult to diagnose preoperatively and is a per-operative diagnosis. The diagnosis was confirmed per-operatively. Ultrasound scanning is the only routine preoperative imaging for gall stone disease and MRCP and CT scanning are carried out occasionally and selectively, based on any suspicions.*
- d) *During two pre-op consultations, patient was only accompanied by Dr. Asif Razza and no other family member was present in neither pre-op nor post-op visits. I accepted patient's verbal & written consent for treatment, in the presence of Dr. Asif Razza. In addition to this patient also had all basic*